

the competence to discern evidential relations, a competence that is responsive to evidential connections in terms of *degrees* of evidential salience. This is a competence patently attributed to pagans by Jesus himself.

[1]

**When the same method yields a "proof"
of two mutually exclusive positions, the
problem has got to be the method**

Here is a fanciful example to capture the logic of Charlie Brown's dilemma. (Lucy hates fanciful examples, but she grudgingly admits that logical points can be made off them).

Suppose our moon was colonized eons ago by a quite slowly reproducing group of space aliens called Uglers. What passes for their brains is (of course) silicon based, and given that silicon based brains produce utterly phlegmatic societies, Uglers never get worked up about anything except maintaining their fundamental life functions and, as per their mission instruction, precisely maintaining zero population growth. They carry on quite successfully, if drably and routinely, *below* the lunar surface about a thousand meters.

Now suppose that you the reader, as well as I, are in the habit of consulting tea leaves when it comes to firming up our convictions, one way or the other, about whether an account like the above is actually true. Keep in mind that we are both *unshakably* imbued with what we take to be the stellar epistemological value of the tea leaf test (never mind why), and that we both tend to get quite passionate whenever the subject comes up.

You probably suspect what is coming next. Suppose that on *my* tea leaf reading the existence of the "sublunar" Uglers is certified, whereas *your* test proves negative. I am, accordingly, of the *unshakable* conviction that the Uglers are real; you, however, (by parity of method!) regard my conviction as nonsense (and may suspect that I am perhaps smoking my leaves rather than reading them). Keep in mind that quite apart from the strange method that has the final say in our choices, by stipulation the story about the Uglers *is* true. Moreover, by *your* lights (leaves), it is Saturn's moon Titan that has been colonized, only the alien colonists there are not so